TAIWAN-EDUCATED TEACHERS OF ENGLISH: THEIR LINGUISTIC CAPITAL, AGENCY, AND PERSPECTIVES ON THEIR IDENTITIES AS LEGITIMATE ENGLISH TEACHERS

Pei Chia Liao

ABSTRACT

NNESTs have diverse educational backgrounds. For example, a number of non-native English-speaking teachers (NNESTs) have obtained their degrees abroad in English-speaking countries and have returned to their countries in English-as-a-foreign-language (EFL) contexts, working alongside NNESTs who have been educated domestically. Yet, little is known about how such EFL-educated NNESTs assert their identities as legitimate English teachers while encountering those colleagues who have been educated in English-speaking countries as well as those who are native English speakers. Few studies have illustrated the complexity and tensions EFL-educated NNESTs encounter as they position themselves as legitimate English educators and English speakers. Focusing on two Taiwan-educated Taiwanese teachers of English and drawing on concepts of capital and agency, this qualitative case study investigates how the linguistic capital of the English language serves as an essential prerequisite for being considered legitimate English educators in Taiwan. This study also examines why earning this highly-valued linguistic capital and being able to turn their capital-gaining experience into one of their pedagogical resources enabled Tera and Guan to assert themselves as legitimate English teachers, in considering the sociopolitical, institutional, and teaching contexts where these teachers worked. This study also offers an analysis of the interconnectedness of agency and capital. Lastly, it further examines how the teachers did not think they shared the ownership of the English language, despite being excellent English speakers and users. Suggestions are provided for NNEST pre-service language teacher education and ongoing professional development.

Key Words: linguistic capital, agency, ownership of the English language

In recent years, many researchers in the field of teacher education have dedicated themselves to the topic of teachers' self-concepts (Morgan, 2004; Varghese, 2007). However, studies on how non-native English-speaking teachers (NNESTs) assert themselves as legitimate English educators are underrepresented in the literature of English teacher education. In addition, many researchers have discussed the discrimination faced by NNESTs or their marginalized status in the English teaching profession. For example, Boraie (2013) stated that many NNESTs encounter discrimination in hiring practices or in receiving work assignments, and it is not uncommon to see classified advertisements for English teachers highlighting "native speakers preferred" or "native English speakers only". Furthermore, because the English language is embedded in issues of race and empire, English language teachers from outer and expanding circle countries or those who do not possess a Caucasian appearance could still be at a disadvantage in terms of both securing employment and asserting themselves as legitimate TESOL professionals (Lin, Wang, Akamatsu, & Riazi, 2002; Motha, 2014; Reis, 2010).

It is only over the past two decades that researchers in the field of English education have engaged in conversations regarding issues of NNESTs (Liao, 2014). However, Motha (2014) found that the representativeness of English remains often associated with mainstream English-speaking countries. Additionally, in the English teaching profession, many employers in non-English-speaking countries highly value diplomas or certificates from the inner-circle English-speaking countries (Moussu & Llurda, 2008). In considering these two points, we know very little about how EFL-educated NNESTs assert their identities as legitimate English teachers when encountering their colleagues who have been educated in English-speaking countries as well as those who are native English speakers. Few studies have illustrated the complexity and tensions EFL-educated NNESTs encounter as they position themselves as legitimate English educators and English speakers.

This study brings to the forefront the perspectives of two Taiwan-educated Taiwanese English teachers on their identities as legitimate English teaching professionals. This study illustrates how the linguistic capital of the English language serves as an essential prerequisite for being considered legitimate English educators in Taiwan. This study also explains why holding this highly valued capital and being able to turn their capital-gaining experiences into their pedagogical resources

enabled the teachers to consider themselves as legitimate English teachers. Furthermore, this study examines the interconnectedness of agency and capital. The following question guided this study: What are the resources that Taiwan-educated English teachers draw on to assert themselves as legitimate English teachers?

THEORETICAL BACKGROUND

NNESTs and Their Identities as Legitimate English Educators

Pavlenko (2003) conducted a pioneering study that touched upon the issue of NNESTs' legitimacy. She provided a broad perspective on NNESTs' legitimacy by advocating the concept of the imagined identities of NNESTs as multicompetent, bilingual, and multilingual speakers. Pavlenko illustrated how a second language (L2) speaker of English identified herself as a multicompetent speaker instead of a failed user of English. Pavlenko also described how an L2 speaker of English reshaped herself as a good bilingualist "who has a larger and richer repertoire of linguistic and cultural knowledge" (p. 263). Drawing on these examples, Pavlenko argued that newly imagined identities are important tools used by members from peripheral communities (i.e., L2 users of English) as they transform into legitimate participants in professional communities, such as the English teaching profession.

Adding to the work of Pavlenko (2003), Golombek and Jordan (2005) examined how two Taiwanese TESOL students asserted their legitimacy in teaching English pronunciation in the context of the United States. Golombek and Jordan's case study was the first study that explicitly centered on the legitimacy of non-native English speakers as teachers of English. In addition, although Golombek and Jordan did not explicitly provide their definition of legitimacy, they used the terms legitimacy and credibility interchangeably throughout their article. In the present study, drawing on the idea of Golombek and Jordan, legitimacy of NNESTs is conceptualized as their credibility as English teachers.

Golombek and Jordan (2005) indicated that there are tensions in how NNESTs thought of themselves as legitimate speakers and teachers of English. For example, one of the teachers stated that even though she received extensive English education in Taiwan and had TESOL training in the United States, she felt conflicted in asserting her legitimacy as an English teacher because she could not participate in English

conversations with native English speakers without making grammatical errors. Sometimes she doubted whether native English speakers completely understood what she had said. Despite being a competent English speaker, the participant questioned her legitimacy in teaching English pronunciation primarily based on her intelligibility by native English speakers.

Although NNESTs' perspectives on their identities as legitimate English teachers can be conflicted (Golombek & Jordan, 2005), some NNESTs are able to consider themselves legitimate English language educators by drawing on their degrees in the United States or Canada (Golombek & Jordan, 2005; Ilieva, 2010). However, we know very little about what resources EFL-educated NNESTs draw on to assert their identities as legitimate English teachers. Furthermore, there is a certain degree of unquestioned legitimacy attributed to teachers who speak mainstream English, or Standard English (Motha, 2014). The native speaker myth continues to harm the professional lives and sense of legitimacy of many qualified NNESTs (Brutt-Griffler & Samimy, 1999; Golombak & Jordan, 2005; Motha, 2006, 2014; Pavlenko, 2003; Reis, 2010).

The Legitimacy of Taiwan-educated Taiwanese English Teachers

Following the work of Pavlenko (2003) and Golombek and Jordan (2005), this study adds to the conversation regarding the legitimacy of Taiwan-educated Taiwanese English teachers. First, in this study emphasis is placed on the participants' dual roles as English learners and English educators, and shows how these two roles can, at first glance, be contradictory. For instance, in Mandarin, the term "teacher" (*lao shi*) contains the word "*shi*", which means "a master" of a subject. How do Taiwanese English teachers claim their identities as legitimate teachers of English when their English is unlikely to be "perfect" or mistake-free? In addition, the social norm of "teacher as expert" (Britzman, 1991) is still prevalent in Taiwanese educational contexts, and Taiwanese people in general value teachers and respect people in this occupation. This social norm also creates the idea that English teachers are the authority on the English language in class, and thus, if teachers reveal uncertainty or make unintentional mistakes in using the English language in class, it may shape their sense of legitimacy as English educators. In light of Kamhi-Stein's (2005) point that NNESTs' self-perceptions may affect their instructional practices and contribute to their success (or failure) as

educators, a lack of legitimacy may undermine their instruction and be costly to NNESTs.

Additionally, in many EFL contexts, native English speakers and Standard English are still seen, to some extent, as most desirable in the English-teaching profession (Boraie, 2013; Holliday, 2005). Furthermore, as stated earlier, the representativeness of English is still often associated with the English-speaking "West" (Motha, 2014). Moussu and Llurda (2008) further asserted that in non-English-speaking countries, many employers highly value diplomas or certificates from inner circle countries where English is used as the first language. In considering these points, the legitimacy of many English teaching professionals who learned English or pursued their studies in EFL contexts (in this case, in Taiwan) could be more intensely challenged.

Capital

In order to understand the resource(s) the participants draw on to assert themselves as legitimate English teachers, Bourdieu's (1977a, 1977b, 1986) concept of capital provides useful insights. Capital means material and immaterial resources that grant power to the people who have access to them (Bourdieu, 1986; Chang & Kanno, 2010). This study particularly sheds light on linguistic capital, and *capital* and *resources* are used interchangeably. Linguistic capital refers to one's competence in a language or in using the privileged variety of a language, for example, speaking with the standard accent (Chang & Kanno, 2010). In the present study, linguistic capital mainly refers to the participants' competence in the English language, including how they strived to speak "beautiful English", in the participants' words, in order to gain credibility. Furthermore, one of the teacher's linguistic capital of Mandarin—her knowledge in Mandarin poetry—illustrates how she incorporated this particular capital into her teaching. Habitus also plays a central role in Bourdieu's theory. From Bourdieu's perspective, it is the interaction among capital, habitus, and field that generates the logic of people's practice (Wacquant, 1989). Although Bourdieu's concept of habitus can be multi-layered and researchers may conceptualize it variously, in the present study habitus refers to strategies that people develop in order to adapt to the needs of the social world (Bourdieu, 1977a). This study includes a description of how the participants developed habitus, or strategies, to gain pedagogical success or to be considered as more legitimate. Additionally, although this study centers on linguistic capital,

one form of capital can often be converted into another in Bourdieu's conceptualization of capital (Oropeza, Varghese, & Kanno, 2010).

Agency

Before various concepts of agency are discussed, and how agency is conceptualized in the present study, attention is drawn to Lewis, Enciso, and Moje's (2007) concept of agency, which indicates that researchers' perspectives also play an important role in determining and describing agency. In other words, the researcher also plays a key role in determining what accounts for the participants' agency.

The concepts of agency as an action-oriented endeavor are insightful. For instance, Inden (1990) indicated that agency is the realized capacity of people that helps them to act upon their world and "that capacity is the power of people to act purposively and reflectively" (p.23). Ahearn (2001) and Morris, Menon, and Ames (2001) viewed agents as a source of *planful* action. In accord with this action-oriented aspect of agency, teachers' agency is conceptualized as the action that helps them move from a possibly disadvantaged to a more powerful position in contexts where they work (Liao, 2014). In addition, Giddens's (1979) and Sewell's (1992) ideas of agency are helpful to understand the connection between agency and capital. From Giddens's perspective, people's actions are shaped by the resources they have access to, and people's actions constitute and reproduce resources (Giddens, 1979; Sewell, 1992). In other words, resources empower or constrain human actions (Giddens, 1979; Sewell, 1992). In the present study, the interconnectedness of the teachers' linguistic capital and agency are analyzed and further examined to show how the teachers act as knowledgeable and enabled agents to obtain or accumulate resources that help them position themselves as legitimate English teachers.

Additionally, Inden's (1990) concept of agency also closely echoes the idea by Lantolf and Pavlenko (2001) regarding the connections between agency and contexts. According to Lantolf and Pavlenko, agency "is a relationship that is constantly co-constructed and renegotiated with those around the individual and with the society at large" (p. 148). Drawing on Lantolf and Pavlenko's idea, the present study examines how the sociopolitical, institutional, and teaching contexts where the teachers worked shaped their ideas of capital and explores how they exercise agency to acquire or accumulate the desired linguistic capital of the English language.

10

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This study centers on two Taiwan-educated teachers, and it also sheds light on the contexts where these teachers worked. Through the case-study method, case participants are examined within their teaching contexts (Yin, 2006). A case study answers the "how" questions and focuses on a phenomenon within a particular context (Yin, 2003). Furthermore, the reasons a multi-case study was chosen are primarily because, first of all, this methodology yields detailed, nuanced, and in-depth data. In addition, according to Yin (2003), evidence from multiple cases is more compelling and therefore findings from such a study can be regarded as more robust. Additionally, although each participant's experience and descriptions can be unique, information from a single case can be insightful because it can indicate a larger phenomenon or inform common circumstances (Wolcott, 2005).

This study was based on the author's dissertation research, in which a qualitative case study was conducted with six participants teaching at a post-secondary level in Taiwan. The inclusion of only two teachers in this study was intentional. First, this study focused in particular on linguistic capital, and both teachers in this study were the case examples of how teachers' linguistic capital shaped their perspectives on being legitimate English-teaching professionals; therefore, employed purposeful sampling (Merriam, 2009) was chosen to allow selection of the participants who represented case examples to fit the central focus of this study. Second, there was interest in bringing to the forefront the voices and perspectives of these two teachers. Focusing on only two teachers enabled the researcher to not only present their narratives more completely, but also to gain more in-depth understanding of the connections among the contexts where they worked, their linguistic capital, and their agency.

Participants and the Research Site

Tera, a pseudonym, indicated that although her formal English education started in junior high school, her mother, who was an English teacher, taught her English when she was little. Tera stated that she knew she liked English when she was young and enjoyed learning it in school. Tera also mentioned that her high school English teacher had never studied abroad but spoke English very well. According to Tera, at that time when it was very rare for English teachers to use English as a medium for instruction in Taiwan, her teacher did so and constantly encouraged

her students to be more brave in speaking English. From her teacher, Tera learned that it was not necessary to study abroad in order to speak good English. Tera also noted that she knew the teacher's excellent spoken English was earned through her hard work. Tera chose Foreign Languages and Literature for her undergraduate study and proceeded to pursue a master's degree in the same field. She also explained that studying abroad was not an option for her at that time because of her family's financial situation. After graduating from her master's program, Tera worked as an English lecturer at Wen University. At the time this study was conducted, she had 21 years of teaching experience at Wen University.

The teacher whom I call Guan started learning English in junior high. Guan mentioned that she liked English at that time and knew she was good at language learning because she liked to talk to people and did not feel shy speaking English with others. Her love of language learning led Guan to choose English Language and Literature for her undergraduate major. She started teaching English to children as a part-time job in a private institute when she was a freshman in college. After college, she wanted to study English further, and therefore she pursued her master's in the same field. Guan noted that her uncle could offer financial support if she chose to study abroad for her master's degree; however, being the eldest child in her family, Guan preferred not to increase her family's financial burden, so she decided to pursue her master's degree in Taiwan. During the final year of her master's program, she taught English part-time in an evening class at a college, and she said this teaching experience prompted her to pursue doctoral study so she could teach in a university. Guan continued teaching English part-time at some colleges while pursuing her doctoral degree in TESOL. At the time this study was conducted, Guan was working as an assistant professor and had taught at Wen University for two years. Prior to her two years at Wen University, she had taught English for 13 years across a wide range of contexts in terms of students' ages and English levels.

One noteworthy observation from her interviews was that when asked about her educational background, Guan answered by saying she was not a typical case because she did not attend "good schools," in her words. Guan stated that her high school, college, and her MA graduate school were "not-so-good" schools. Guan explained that her grades in junior high were not good enough so she entered a vocational high school rather than a regular type of high school. Her grades in vocational high school were fine but "not good enough" so she entered a

"not-so-famous" technical college rather than a traditional four-year college. Guan pursued her doctoral study in a national university, which "had a good academic reputation in Taiwan," she commented.

Both Tera and Guan taught in the English department at Wen University, where they were required to use English as the medium of instruction. Wen University is well-known for its long history of excellence in foreign language teaching in Taiwan. In addition to English, the university has departments of Japanese, Spanish, German, and French. In the English department, the ratio of NNESTs who had graduated in English-speaking countries versus Taiwan-graduated NNESTs (both full-time and part-time teachers) was 49:19. Of the 49 educated outside of Taiwan, 24 were US-educated NNESTs. There were also three native English speakers from the United States working as full-time English teachers.

Data Collection

The two teachers were interviewed, and eleven semi-structured interviews were conducted. Each interview lasted 30-80 minutes. The teachers were given the choice of being interviewed in Mandarin or in English, and both of them chose to be interviewed in Mandarin (and at times they expressed ideas in English). Informed consent was obtained for audio recording of their interviews, and all interviews were fully translated and transcribed.

Three non-participant class observations were also conducted with each participant. Each observation lasted for roughly 110 minutes. Particular attention was paid to the available resource(s) the participants drew on while they taught and the strategies they used to their advantage pedagogically. Detailed field notes were kept for every observation undertaken. The teachers' pseudonyms were used, and no identifying student information was recorded in the field notes.

To understand the teaching contexts described by the participants, in addition to conducting class observations, a collection of documents was reviewed, including class handouts and course syllabi that the participants had created. This review of documents served to supplement and highlight what was learned from the interviews and observations. Emails were sent to Tera and Guan, asking for clarification regarding some unclear points in their interviews. Most importantly, the combination of the interviews, field notes, and documents helped achieve triangulation of data collected in this study.

Data Analysis

All interview transcripts underwent open coding, which allowed identification of possible themes arising from the conversations and the field notes. In addition, within-case and cross-case analysis (Miles & Huberman, 1994) were utilized so that similarities or differences in the cases could be examined. Each participant was also provided with their individual interview transcripts and copies of the initial data analysis in order to engage in member checks. Additionally, how the participants described and constructed their sense of legitimacy as English teachers was a focus for examination, and thus no clear-cut definitions of legitimacy were provided during the interviews.

Through the interviews and stories they told, the participants provided a great deal of information about their English learning and teaching experiences. Their stories, reflecting on their feelings and journey of English learning and teaching, also deeply motivated the researcher to analyze their narratives with the intention to present and strongly support her arguments. Many scholars (e.g. Alsup, 2006; Amey, 1999; Clandinin & Connelly, 2000; Motha, Jain, & Tecle, 2012) have employed a combination of general or professional life histories and narratives to examine the cultural experiences of participants in varying educational settings. Furthermore, the analysis of the participants' narratives helped achieve a better and deeper understanding of their English learning and teaching experiences in various contexts.

FINDINGS

Both Tera and Guan asserted their identities as legitimate English educators by predominantly drawing on their linguistic capital of the English language, and they both acknowledged that having English language competence served as an essential prerequisite for being considered legitimate English teachers in Taiwan. In the next section is a description of how Tera and Guan strived to gain this capital.

"I had a lack of that kind of [English-speaking] environment, so I needed to create that kind of environment": Tera's Linguistic Capital

Tera considered her English reading skill as the best among the four English language skills (listening, reading, speaking, and writing) and

speaking as more challenging. Tera stated that the high demand of giving presentations and having class discussions with her classmates and professors in her master's study made her realize that she needed to work harder on speaking. After experiencing frustration over her performance in speaking English, particularly after her first year of master's study, Tera was determined to modify her English-speaking learning environment. She stated:

> At that time when there was no Internet, I subscribed to a monthly English learning magazine, and this magazine had lots of English conversations. You know what I did? I memorized all conversations from the magazine every month. I even imitated the male and female speakers' voices and had conversations all done by myself…That was quite fun.

Tera also commented that, throughout the training that she gave to herself, she found herself "like a parrot imitating people's speaking quite well." When asked her motivation for memorizing conversations from the magazine, Tera explained that she believed those conversations were "at least written and edited by native English speakers". She further elaborated:

> I was not in the United States. I did not learn my English in an English-speaking environment, so I needed to find ways to help myself. At that time the only thing we can do is to listen more…. I could not be like people who stayed in the United States speaking English so fluently because they soaked in that English-speaking environment. I had a lack of that kind of environment so I needed to create that kind of environment.

Tera's final statement about needing "to create that kind of environment" demonstrates her agency, which researchers argue as action-oriented (e.g. Inden, 1990; Varghese, Morgan, Johnston, & Johnson, 2005). As an English educator, Tera also exercised great agency in finding strategies to gain the linguistic capital of the English language, especially during the beginning stage of her teaching career. Tera mentioned that, during her first year teaching at Wen University, she led a meeting for parents of her students. She described her educational background to the parents, and after the meeting, one of the mothers came to her and asked, "Teacher, you have never been to the U.K. or America and you teach our kids English?" Tera mentioned that, even after twenty years, she still

remembered the parent's comment vividly:

> [At that time] I felt as if I was being punched in the face…I know some people, some parents must have doubts about Taiwan-educated English teachers…I was hurt and I could only promise her that I would try to teach them well. I was speechless afterward, and I knew I needed to work hard.

Knowing that some people would have doubts about her English language competence due to her domestic educational background, Tera knew she needed to accumulate her linguistic capital of the English language in order to earn her legitimacy as an English teacher. For example, Tera hired a native English-speaking tutor majoring in English Literature to discuss English literature and worked with the tutor for three months before she started to teach an English literature course. She recorded every tutoring session with a bulky recorder and reviewed the sessions constantly. Asked about why she wanted to hire a tutor before she started teaching the course, Tera explained:

> I wanted to have a native speaker to help my speaking… In class we compared our interpretations of readings and I wanted to make sure that my interpretations were correct…it is their language and their culture after all…. I felt less worried about teaching that class after this training.

In addition to hiring a native English speaker as her tutor, Tera also emphasized why speaking "authentic English" is of importance in the context where she worked:

> It is a global environment, and when students learn English, they expect to have NESTs. Since I am not a NEST, it is even more necessary to have good spoken English…. As an English teacher, I help them [students] learn the foreign language. Then I could not speak English with a weird accent. They may be like little parrots too. So I try my best to have authentic English pronunciation.

Furthermore, Tera indicated that at times she would share stories with her students about how she gained linguistic capital "from the hard way," in Tera's words. Tera also stated that she realized perhaps some students wanted to learn English well but had limited access to financial resources to study abroad. She wanted to use her stories to encourage those students. She noted every time when she shared her learning

experience in class, those students listened quite attentively. Tera mentioned two students once told her that they were impressed by her "beautiful English," as her students put it, and were amazed by her dedication in learning English. They further stated that they wanted to set her as their role model.

In addition to acquiring linguistic capital of the English language, Tera also incorporated the linguistic capital of Mandarin into her English Poetry class. Tera's knowledge of some Mandarin poems originated from her passion for reading. Tera stated:

> I love to read, both novels and poems. I enjoy reading poems both in English and Mandarin because they are short. I also love reading English novels in my summer and winter vacations… I am the kind of reader who can be fully engaged in books and thus lose track of time.

Tera stated that one time in her English Poetry class she had an exchange student from the United States. At the beginning of that semester, Tera did not feel comfortable having him in class because "I was not sure if the American student wanted to learn English poetry from me," Tera explained. A few weeks later, Tera learned that the student's Mandarin was at an intermediate level so she started to introduce Chinese poems in class. Sometimes she would compare and contrast Chinese and English poems that were written in the same era. Sometimes she would talk about Chinese poems featuring similar themes with those of English poems discussed. After that semester, Tera noticed that not only did the American student enjoy the class because he learned some Chinese poems, but other students mentioned that those eastern versus western poetry discussion sessions were interesting and "made learning more relatable," as Tera recalled a comment from a student. Tera noted that nowadays she would introduce several Chinese poems in her English Poetry class, sometimes as warm-up activities or as supplemental materials to the featured English poems. For example, one time in my observation of her Poetry class, Tera did a warm-up activity by introducing a well-known Chinese poem called 楓橋夜泊 *(Feng Ciao Ye Bo)* and then asked the students questions about imagery (visual, auditory, olfactory, tactile, etc.). After this activity, Tera moved on to introducing the topic of that class session—imagery—and started to teach the featured English poems. This exemplified how Tera utilized her knowledge of Mandarin in her English Poetry class and how her

17

linguistic capital of Mandarin helped her teach more creatively. The idea of how capital enables agency will be further described in the Discussion section.

"I can still have lots of English learning opportunities in Taiwan": Guan's Linguistic Capital and Her Resources of Online Tools

Similar to Tera, Guan also worked hard to earn the linguistic capital of the English language, in speaking and vocabulary particularly. Guan considered her English speaking ability to be the best among the four skills. Guan added that, although she did not think that she had mastered the English speaking ability, her speaking skills improved rapidly after she started to teach English, and she then eventually became better at speaking. Guan explained that, when she started teaching English, she taught five children and this teaching experience greatly increased her English-speaking competence because she needed to enunciate words and therefore spoke English very clearly for her students. Guan further described how she gained English speaking competence at that time:

> I made great efforts to speak English well for my students… I tried to pronounce words just like the native speakers in our CDs; I imitated their pronunciation and intonation and then demonstrated in class. After I did this for a while, these features [of pronunciation and intonation] became mine. Also, at the beginning I did not link some words together when I spoke English. Now the pronunciation tip of linking words was almost internalized because I keep teaching and keep speaking lots of English to my students. … To practice my speaking, for a long period of time, I talked to myself in English while I rode my motorcycle as I commuted to work. Overall I feel my speaking is good, and based on my speaking, some students might not know I had never studied abroad.

Guan's initial motivation to practice English speaking was for teaching, and because of her effort in practicing it, Guan knew that she had internalized some native speakers' pronunciation and intonation, and later those features became her own. In addition, Guan felt she did not gain the linguistic capital of the English language in speaking through the education system in Taiwan because, in her words, "speaking was not the main focus."

Guan also established her linguistic capital of English vocabulary by self-learning. Guan stated that during college she always had this idea in

18

mind that as an English major, it might be better to study abroad in an English-speaking country in order to gain as much vocabulary as possible, just like many of her professors had done. However, when she started to teach English, there was one incident that persuaded her that she could still learn English well without studying abroad. One day in class, the students asked her if she knew the English word for *yan hui gang* (ash tray in Mandarin). She told the students the answer, and the students told her that they had asked another teacher who had studied abroad but she did not know the answer. Guan then explained to the students that she had bought a vocabulary book one summer and had memorized almost all the words from that book during that summer. Guan further explained to the students that it was not the teacher's fault. She told the students that "Many people may not know the English word ash tray if they are non-smokers. It is hard for them to pick up this word if they do not need this particular thing in their lives." Furthermore, Guan stated that sometimes she used this example of learning vocabulary to encourage her students that they could learn English well in Taiwan as long as they make an effort. Additionally, determined not to let her domestic educational background be a hindrance to acquiring English vocabulary, Guan worked hard on vocabulary in order to position herself more powerfully.

In addition to gaining the linguistic capital of the English language, Guan used numerous online resources as pedagogical tools. She stated that this strategy made her stand out among the faculty. Guan straightforwardly stated that she was keenly aware of her status as a NNEST and although she might not be able to produce "100% authentic" English sentences, she knew she was good at using online resources. "I use many online resources to make up for my drawback of not being a NEST and to help my students write sentences as accurately and authentically as possible," Guan noted. For example, Guan used *OneLook*, an online dictionary which searched for definitions of words or phrases from multiple online dictionaries. She also used *Ginger,* an online grammar checker. Guan explained that she learned about some of these resources while she was a PhD student and she kept using the ones she felt the most useful. Now as a teacher, she asked her students to use these resources so she could "teach those students some self-learning resources" and she herself could continue learning and using these tools. Indeed, during my two observations in her Translation and Writing class, Guan checked whether the students used these online tools each time. In mid-semester Guan asked the class to meet in a computer lab instead of a

regular classroom, and she demonstrated using those tools in class when necessary. Besides using those online tools, Guan also subscribed to an E-journal which contained information about new apps, new English learning games, or new technology features related to English learning. She further posted that technological information on her blog, and now on her Facebook wall, to share with her students. "Students regard me as a resourceful teacher…I am good at finding resources and this skill makes me stand out, even among very experienced teachers or teachers who received degrees abroad," Guan stated. Additionally, Guan's comments about producing "authentic English" will be further discussed in the Discussion section.

Like Tera, Guan also indicated that she enjoyed sharing her English-learning experience in class. For example, if Guan felt some students were not confident enough to speak up in class, she would share stories about how she practiced her spoken English in order to encourage and motivate the students. Furthermore, Guan also indicated that she shared her learning experience with a sense of purpose: "I want to demonstrate that even though I did not study abroad, I can still have lots of English learning opportunities in Taiwan." Guan stated that without studying abroad, she was capable of expanding her horizons and learning English well by using online tools properly. She also mentored her students to do the same thing so they could expand their horizons and sharpen their English skills.

DISCUSSION

At the beginning of this discussion section, attention was first drawn to the contexts where the teachers worked, including the larger sociopolitical and institutional environment, as well as their teaching contexts. Next explored were the connections between the contexts and highly-valued linguistic capital of the English language. Also analyzed was how Guan faced tension and felt conflicted as she attempted to value highly her excellent spoken English that legitimized her as English teacher. The second part of the discussion section offers an analysis of the interconnectedness of agency and capital. Then will be examined why owning linguistic capital and being able to turn their capital-gaining stories into one of their pedagogical resources helped the teachers assert themselves as legitimate English educators. Lastly, how the teachers did not think they shared the ownership of the English language will be examined.

20

The Sociopolitical, Institutional, and Teaching Contexts and English Language as Linguistic Capital

English is not spoken as a daily language but holds an irreplaceable role in Taiwanese education since it is one of the tickets to the global opportunities in considering the export-dependent economy of Taiwan (Wu, 2011). In order to gain global competitiveness, the Taiwanese government has highly emphasized raising the level of college students' English proficiency. The English teaching force at the higher education level plays an important role in helping students not only learn but also excel in English.

However, native-speakerism is still in favor in many EFL contexts and native-speakerism remains popular to some extent in the English teaching profession (Boraie, 2013; Golombek & Jordan, 2005), and Taiwan is no exception. For example, people to some extent believe that Standard English belongs to inner circle countries where English is used as the first language and native speakers of English are more desirable teachers of English. Many institutions in Taiwan, including schools at the post-secondary level, specifically indicate that they are looking for native speakers of English in job advertisements for English teachers. Motha (2014) noted that in many EFL contexts, "English teachers are discriminated against, tripping over job advertisements for native English speakers" (p. 118). In addition, when looking for teaching candidates, some higher education institutions in EFL contexts specifically state that teachers with study abroad experience could be a plus in terms of their qualifications. Furthermore, as mentioned earlier, a number of employers in EFL contexts highly value diplomas or certificates from inner circle English-speaking countries (Moussu & Llurda, 2008).

In light of what has been presented above, the reason why Tera and Guan highly valued their linguistic capital of the English language seems quite understandable. Furthermore, as this study shows, both of them highly emphasized the importance of having proficiency in spoken English in their teaching contexts. English-speaking skills could have been underscored by the teachers based on a practical reason: both of them used English as the medium of instruction (EMI). Because of this EMI trend, institutional expectations toward post-secondary teachers' English proficiency are getting higher than ever. The trend also places a higher expectation on English teachers in Taiwan regarding their English proficiency. Additionally, Tera and Guan mentioned that they currently

felt a higher demand to speak English well based on the fact that students nowadays have easier access to English and their average English-speaking performance is better than ever, compared to that of the students in their early teaching careers.

Tera further added that, when she taught English speaking classes, she felt concerned at times when she got tongue-tied in class. She was not sure how students would perceive her as a legitimate teaching professional in those situations. Tera's concern echoes some researchers (e.g., Amin, 2001; Braine, 2004; Canagarajah, 1999, 2005; Morita, 2004) who determined that if NNESTs make some occasional English mistakes or do not appear to know everything about the English language, their English competencies could be questioned by their students or even by the NNESTs themselves. The teachers then experience feelings of inadequacy or inferiority if they have a low self-image (Reves & Medgyes, 1994), and these feelings may further lead them to doubt their identities as legitimate English educators. Additionally, as stated earlier, the cultural norm of "teachers as experts" (Britzman, 1991) is still quite common in Taiwan. In considering this cultural norm, NNESTs' English performance plays a critical role in how people (including colleagues, students, students' parents, etc.) perceive their legitimacy as English educators.

As mentioned previously, Tera encountered a challenging situation where her student's parent felt unsure of her legitimacy as an English teacher and her English competence due to her domestic educational background. Tera worked hard to acquire linguistic capital of the English language in order to assert her legitimacy as a teacher of English. Furthermore, considering that her Taiwanese students would expect native English speakers to be their teachers, Tera made particular effort to speak "authentic" English. Tera stated that gaining linguistic capital in spoken English in order to "speak English beautifully" and "authentically" helped her tremendously in asserting her identity as a legitimate English teaching professional. Tera's statement confirms Motha's (2014) idea that teachers who speak mainstream English possess a certain degree of unquestioned legitimacy. Tera's examples also illustrate that the highly valued capital was shaped by the contexts where she worked. Earning this highly valued capital and sharing her stories regarding how she gained access to this capital with her students enabled Tera to assert her identity as a legitimate English teacher.

Guan, however, revealed an interesting yet juxtaposed perspective. Guan confirmed that it was important to speak "authentic" English, and

she further stated that speaking "authentic" English helped her establish some authority over her students. As Guan put it, "Students wouldn't question me about my English or my legitimacy of teaching English if I spoke good English." However, she also felt conflicted about her effort to speak English like a native speaker in her speaking classes due to her understanding that there are a variety of Englishes and that mainstream English, or Standard English, is only one such variety.

I argue that Guan's statement pinpoints the conflicts of many NNESTs. While understanding the importance of embracing a variety of usages and accents in the English language, some English teachers (including the two teachers in this study) still dedicate themselves to striving for better or even near native-like English proficiency, especially in speaking. They know their English speaking proficiency helps them claim legitimacy as English teaching professionals in the contexts where they worked. Moreover, on the one hand, many NNESTs have to keep trying to perfect their own English in order to earn their legitimacy as English teaching professionals and to meet the expectations from their institutions, students, students' parents, and so on. On the other hand, they also have to establish a different goal for English speaking proficiency for most of their students as English learners.

The Interconnectedness of Agency and Capital

This study demonstrates that agency plays a key role in (re)producing capital and capital also enables one's agency (Giddens, 1979; Sewell, 1992). The following examples from Tera and Guan illustrate how their agency produced capital. Realizing that she had a lack of an English-speaking environment and that she needed to improve her speaking skills, Tera memorized and practiced English conversations from a monthly English learning magazine. She also hired an English-speaking tutor who majored in English literature so she could not only practice her speaking skills but also discuss literature concepts with the tutor. From Tera's perspectives, the native English-speaking editors of the magazine and her tutor possessed the linguistic capital of the English language that she did not possess, and thus she exercised agency to gain this highly valued capital. In addition, Guan employed agency to acquire the linguistic capital of the English language, particularly in speaking and vocabulary: she practiced her pronunciation diligently and thanks to her dedicated efforts in practicing speaking English, Guan mentioned that she not only "had internalized some

23

native-speakers' pronunciation and intonation" but also had gained fluency. Guan also made an effort to acquire English vocabulary such as by memorizing English words from a book. Both Tera and Guan demonstrated being active human agents to gain the highly-valued linguistic capital of the English language.

Both Tera and Guan provide telling examples illustrating how the teachers' capital, or their resources in general, enabled their agency. The teachers incorporated resources into their classes and this strategy, or in Bourdieu's (1977a) concept habitus, became their pedagogical successes. Tera's linguistic capital of Mandarin shaped her teaching practices and she was capable of using this capital to help her teach English poetry more creatively. The discussion sessions featuring both eastern and western poems on the same topics were remarkable as it made her students' learning relatable and more meaningful. Guan's example of using numerous online tools in her Translation and Interpretation class demonstrated how her habitus shaped her pedagogy, which include keeping up-to-date with the latest technology featuring English learning and teaching, utilizing those online tools in class, and sharing the technological information with her students virtually. More importantly, Guan acknowledged that her information of the latest technology and using online tools in class helped her earn a certain degree of credibility and recognition from her students.

In addition to confirming the interconnectedness of agency and capital, this study also resonates with Lantolf and Pavlenko's (2001) idea regarding the close connections between agency and context. From the findings of this study, it can be argued that the contexts where these teachers worked shaped their habitus—that is, they developed a series of action, or strategies, to earn the highly valued capital in those contexts. Examples from Guan provided strong support for the above argument. Guan recalled that at the beginning of her teaching career, if students asked her about her educational background, she would straightforwardly tell the students that "If I tell you the truth, you cannot look down on me." Guan mentioned that even now after having fifteen years of teaching experience under her belt, she would not mention her educational background initially in class unless the students asked. As Guan put it: "People do have stereotypes; students may question my ability because I am not a NEST, and I did not attend very good schools. Only after they trust my professionalism can I then tell them about my educational background." In addition, being keenly aware of the fact that she did not

"have an impressive educational background," Guan deliberately tried hard to enrich her teaching experience. Guan was in her mid-thirties at the time when this study was conducted, and she had already had fifteen years of teaching experience. Guan noted:

> I realized that my educational background was not beautiful and if I have good teaching experience, people would consider hiring me….
> I try to convince people that you can see my teaching experience to judge my teaching, rather than merely seeing my educational background.

Realizing that she did not have an impressive educational background and thus people may have stereotypes, Guan acted purposively to enrich her teaching experience. This strategy exemplifies how Guan's habitus was adapted to the needs of her situated contexts.

Additionally, Tera and Guan also revealed the same kind of empathy for their students: recognizing that some students were concerned about their limited English-speaking opportunities in Taiwan, Tera and Guan served as excellent role models demonstrating that they could still excel in spoken English despite their domestic educational backgrounds. They also intentionally shared their learning experience in order to encourage and inspire their students. Working hard to earn the highly-valued linguistic capital and being able to turn those stories into one of their pedagogical tools enabled Tera and Guan to assert themselves as legitimate English teachers. More importantly, in light of the teachers' English learning strategies, it can be argued that although Tera and Guan did not seem to challenge the deep-seated ideologies related to native speakers' superiority, they served as strong advocates for themselves asserting their own legitimacy in teaching English. The reason they did not challenge those ideologies may result from their perspectives on the ownership of the English language. Elaboration on this point follows below.

Ownership of the English Language

This study also showed that neither Tera nor Guan thought they shared in the ownership of the English language, despite being excellent English speakers and users. The following analysis supports this argument. First of all, they both raised an important issue regarding the "authenticity" of the English language. As mentioned previously, realizing that she lacked an English-speaking environment, Tera memorized English conversations from a monthly magazine and

practiced persistently. She knew this practice was helpful because "at least the authors and editors [of that magazine] were native English speakers". Tera also believed that it is important for her to speak "authentic" English because her students were like "little parrots" learning spoken English from her. Additionally, Tera hired a native English speaker majoring in English literature as a tutor. In this way, she believed she could not only practice her English speaking but also compare their interpretations of the literature texts since "it is their language; their culture". Moreover, I have discussed how Guan used several online tools in her Translation and Interpretation class to enhance her teaching. Guan explained that this strategy not only helped her "produce authentic English sentences as much as possible" but also "made up for the drawback of not being a NEST." Tera and Guan believed that their efforts in seeking other resources helped them acquire or produce "authentic" English.

Furthermore, with regard to the teachers' perceptions of their own English language competence, a notable similarity between these two teachers arose. Without being asked to compare their skills to those of native English speakers, both of them automatically rated their English language competence by comparing those skills to those of native English speakers. In addition, Guan evaluated her own English language competence based on her intelligibility to native speakers of English. For example, she stated that she believed her speaking skills were strong because, according to Guan, "my native English-speaking colleagues understood what I said".

Tera's and Guan's affirmations of their English language competence were derived from native English-speakers who, from these teachers' perspectives, owned English to a large extent. In other words, it can be argued that neither teacher thought they shared in the ownership of the English language. They presented an assumption that echoed a point stated earlier—that is, English to some extent belongs to traditionally native English contexts or inner-circle countries. More importantly, Tera's comment about English as "native speakers' language and their culture" also connected to a broader issue in TESOL in international contexts: the ownership of the English language righteously belongs to people from the inner-circle English speaking countries. Teachers from those countries may therefore be perceived to a certain degree as more privileged. At the same time, a certain degree of unquestioned legitimacy is attributed to those teachers, or teachers who

speak mainstream English (Motha, 2014).

CONCLUSIONS AND IMPLICATIONS

In this section, each conclusion is followed by its corresponding implication, and the implications include directions for NNEST pre-service English teacher education and ongoing teacher professional development. First, Tera and Guan were able to consider themselves legitimate English teachers primarily because of their linguistic capital of the English language. In light of this finding, the English language competence of non-native English-speaking student teachers should be strengthened and supported in English teacher education programs. Medgyes (1999) noted that language training is a neglected but needed area of teacher education. Chen and Goh (2011) pinpointed a clear need for teacher training programs to prepare teachers to attain adequate levels of language competence as they embark on their careers. Moreover, this language competence should be further developed through in-service professional development programs (de Oliveira, 2011; Wu, Liang, & Csepelyi, 2010). In the same vein, Nakata (2010) argued that in many EFL contexts, professional development for NNESTs should underscore teachers' English language competence due to the fact that the majority of EFL teachers are NNESTs and there may exist some mismatch between teachers' current level of language proficiency and the language proficiency levels required in their teaching contexts. Furthermore, Medgyes (1999) also stressed that NNESTs' English language proficiency affects their confidence and how they see themselves professionally. Tera's experience supports this argument. As mentioned previously, Tera noted that prior to her undergraduate study, the English education she received in Taiwan highly emphasized reading, writing, and grammar, but not speaking. Therefore, she did not have much confidence in speaking English publicly in class as a student and it had a further impact on her confidence in teaching speaking classes as a novice teacher. In light of this point, Taiwanese teacher education programs and professional development for NNESTs should provide more well-balanced and comprehensive support in terms of all four English language skills. Additionally, while it is important to pay attention to NNESTs' English language competence in their teacher training programs and professional development, pre-service and in-service teacher educators should also emphasize the idea that to

different extents, English of NNESTs is naturally characterized by cross-linguistic influence of their mother tongue (Li, 2007).

Second, the study shows that Tera and Guan drew on their strengths—being able to earn highly-valued linguistic capital and turning their capital-gaining experience into their pedagogical resources—to assert themselves as legitimate English teachers. This suggests that NNESTs can capitalize on their strengths to establish their identities as legitimate English educators. That is to say, NNESTs can craft their identities based on their strengths. In addition, both pre-service and in-service teacher educators can help NNESTs find their strengths to establish their identities as legitimate English educators. I further suggest that teacher preparation and professional development for NNESTs can center on exploring factors to enlarge NNESTs' available resources and enhance their strengths. In other words, teacher preparation and professional development for NNESTs can be more geared toward a strength-based approach. That is, to focus on exploring NNESTs' varying strengths and then capitalizing on their strengths as their teaching resources. Additionally, in considering this point and the first implication just mentioned, examining and supporting NNESTs' English language proficiency in terms of their four skills helps NNESTs reflect on what aspects of linguistic capital are available and develop strategies on how they can take full advantages of those resources.

This study also confirms that teachers' agency helps to produce and accumulate capital (Giddens, 1979; Sewell, 1992). In considering this point, if NNESTs can be aware of their own strengths and teacher educators of NNESTs can support NNESTs to capitalize on their strengths as teaching resources, this can also help NNESTs to develop or generate their sense of agency. While NNESTs' accessibility to resources may be partially shaped by their educational backgrounds, this study shows that Tera and Guan exercised agency to make some changes and were able to gain more desired capital. For example, when Tera and Guan realized that they needed to acquire linguistic capital of the English language in the contexts where they worked, they initiated actions to obtain this linguistic capital. Working hard to earn the highly valued capital and being able to use their stories as examples in order to inspire and motivate their students helped Tera and Guan claim their identities as legitimate English teachers. Agency thus positioned these teachers from a possibly disadvantaged to a more powerful position. It can therefore be argued that teacher educators can help student teachers

realize their agency as professionals at the start of their teacher education. Additionally, most EFL students are educated by their local teachers (Braine, 1999), and therefore, if NNESTs are able to identify their own capital or strengths and develop their agency, they can further inspire students to find their own strengths in terms of their English learning and be agentive English learners.

Lastly, the teachers' belief about their disownership of the English language nonetheless to a certain degree reinforced the idea of native-speakerism. Drawing on Norton (1997), if a language user cannot claim ownership of that language, they may not consider themselves legitimate speakers of that language. In considering this point, a broader ownership of English—that English is now international and its ownership is shifted to whoever wished to use it rather than to people in specific geographic locations (Holliday, 2005)—can be more fully promoted in teacher education programs. Tera and Guan indicated that they received very little instruction on the ownership of the English language in their graduate courses or in their schools. Additionally, this study showed that Tera and Guan strived to speak "native-like" English because they knew it granted them credibility. In considering of this point and the issue of accent in particular, Mackie (2003) proposed that TESOL professionals can help themselves and their students question desires such as speaking "native-like" English. For example, English teachers can use media like movies or TED talks in which characters or speakers do not speak mainstream English. Films such as "Three Idiots" is a good example. Teachers can play those movie or video clips in class and engage students with discourse that supports "multicompetence" and "multilingualism". Furthermore, this kind of reflective, questioning practice will redirect students to think about their language goals from achieving "nativeness" to focusing more on intelligible as well as intelligent content, and this can be a more achievable and meaningful goal for English learners.

REFERENCES

Ahearn, L. (2001). Language and agency. *Annual Review of Anthropology*, *30*, 109-137.

Alsup, J. (2006). *Teacher identity discourses: Negotiating personal and professional spaces*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.

Amey, M. J. (1999). Navigating the raging river: Reconciling issues of identity, inclusion, and administrative practice. In K. M. Shaw, J. R. Valadez, & R. A. Rhoads (Eds.), *Community colleges as cultural texts: Qualitative explorations of organizational and student culture* (pp. 59-82). Albany, NY: SUNY Press.

Amin, N. (2001). Nativism, the native speaker construct, and minority immigrant women teachers of English as a second language. *CATESOL Journal*, *13*, 89-107.

Boraie, D. (2013). NESTs are still idealized. *TESOL Blog*. Retrieved from http://blog .tesol.org/native-english-speaking-teachers-and-trainers-still-idealized/

Bourdieu, P. (1977a). *Outline of a theory of practice* (R. Nice, Trans.) Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Bourdieu, P. (1977b). The economics of linguistic exchanges. *Social Science Information*, *16*, 645-668.

Bourdieu, P. (1986). The forms of capital. In J. Richardson (Ed.), *Handbook of theory and research for the sociology of education* (pp. 241-258). New York, NY: Greenwood.

Braine, G. (2004). The nonnative English-speaking professionals' movement and its research foundations. In L. Kamhi-Stein (Ed.), *Learning and teaching from experience: Perspectives on nonnative English-speaking professionals* (pp. 9-24). Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press.

Britzman, D. P. (1991). *Practice makes practice: A critical study of learning to teach*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.

Brutt-Griffler, J., & Samimy, K. (1999). Revisiting the colonial in the postcolonial: Critical praxis for nonnative-English-speaking teachers in a TESOL program. *TESOL Quarterly*, *33*, 413-431.

Canagarajah, A. S. (1999). Interrogating the "Native Speaker Fallacy": Non-linguistic roots, non-pedagogical results. In G. Braine (Ed.), *Non-native educators in English language teaching*. (pp. 77-92). Mahwah, NJ : Lawrence Erlbaum.

Canagarajah, A. S. (Ed.). (2005). *Reclaiming the local in language policy and practice*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.

Chang, Y. J., & Kanno, Y. (2010). NNES Doctoral Students in English-Speaking Academe: The Nexus between Language and Discipline. *Applied Linguistics*, *31*, 671-692.

Chen, Z., & Goh, C. (2011). Teaching oral English in higher education: Challenges to EFL teachers. *Teaching in Higher Education*, *16*, 333-345.

Clandinin, D. J., & Connelly, F. M. (2000). *Narrative inquiry: Experience and story in qualitative research*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

de Oliveira, L. C. (2011). Strategies for nonnative-English-speaking teachers' continued

development as professionals. *TESOL Journal*, *2*, 229-238.

Giddens, A. (1979). *Central problems in social theory: Action, structure and contradiction in social analysis.* Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Golombek, P., & Jordan, S. (2005). Becoming 'black lambs' not 'parrots': A poststructuralist orientation to intelligibility and identity. *TESOL Quarterly*, *39*, 513-533.

Holliday, A. (2005). *The struggle to teach English as an international language*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Ilieva, R. (2010). Non-native English speaking teachers' negotiations of program discourses in their construction of professional identities within a TESOL program. *The Canadian Modern Language Review*, *66*, 343-369.

Inden, R. (1990). *Imagining India*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell.

Kamhi-Stein, L. D. (2005). Research perspectives on non-native English-speaking professionals. In P. Bruthiaux, D. Atkinson, W. Eggington, W. Grabe, & V. Ramanathan (Eds.), *Directions in applied linguistics: Essays in honor of Robert B. Kaplan* (pp. 72-83). Clevedon, England: Multilingual Matters.

Lantolf, J. P., & Pavlenko, A. (2001). (S)econd (L)anguage (A)ctivity theory: Understanding second language learners as people. In M. P. Breen (Ed.), *Learner contributions to language learning: New directions in research* (pp. 141-158). Essex, England: Pearson Education.

Lewis, C., Enciso, P., & Moje, E. B. (2007). *Reframing sociocultural research on literacy: Identity, agency, and power*. Mahwah, N.J: Lawrence Erlbaum.

Li, D. (2007). Researching and teaching China and Hong Kong English. *English Today*, *23*, 11-17.

Liao, P.-C. (2014). Identity negotiation and demonstration of agency of two NNESTs in the US. *NYS TESOL Journal*, *1*, 27-38.

Lin, A., Wang, W., Akamatsu, N., & Riazi, A. (2002). Appropriating English, expanding identities, and re-visioning the field: From TESOL to Teaching English for Glocalized Communication (TEGCOM), *Journal of Language, Identity & Education*, *1*, 295-316.

Mackie, A. (2003). Race and desire: Toward critical literacies for ESL. *TESL Canada Journal*, *20*(2), 23-37.

Medgyes, P. (1999). Language training: A neglected area in teacher education. In G. Braine (Ed.), *Non-native educators in English language teaching* (pp. 177-195). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.

Merriam, S.B. (2009). *Qualitative research*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Miles, M., & Huberman, M. A. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis: A sourcebook of new methods* (2nd ed.). Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.

Morgan, B. (2004). Teacher identity as pedagogy: Towards a field-internal conceptualization in bilingual and second language education. In J. Brutt-Griffler & M. Varghese (Eds.), *Re-writing bilingualism and the bilingual educator's knowledge base* (pp. 80–96). Clevedon, England: Multilingual Matters.

Morita, N. (2004). Negotiating participation and identity in second language academic

communities. *TESOL Quarterly*, *38*, 573-603.

Morris, M. W., Menon, T., & Ames, D. R. (2001). Culturally conferred conceptions of agency: A key to social perception of persons, groups, and other actors. *Personality and Social Psychology Review*, *5*, 169-182.

Motha, S. (2006). Decolonizing ESOL: Negotiating linguistic power in U.S. public school classrooms. *Critical Inquiry in Language Studies*, *3*, 75-100.

Motha, S. (2014). *Race, empire, and English language teaching: Creating responsible and ethical anti-racist practice*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press.

Motha, S., Jain, R., & Tecle, T. (2012). Translinguistic identity-as-pedagogy: Implications for teacher education. *International Journal of Innovation in English Language Teaching & Research*, *1*, 13-28.

Moussu, L., & Llurda, E. (2008). Non-Native English Speaking English Language Teachers: History and Research. *Language Teaching*, *41*, 315-348.

Nakata, Y. (2010). Improving the classroom language proficiency of non-native teachers of English: What and how? *RELC Journal*, *41*, 76-90.

Norton, B. (1997). Language, Identity, and the Ownership of English. *TESOL Quarterly*, *31*, 409-429.

Oropeza, M. V., Varghese, M. M., & Kanno, Y. (2010). Linguistic minority students in higher education: Using, resisting, and negotiating multiple labels. *Equity & Excellence in Education*, *43*, 216-231.

Pavlenko, A. (2003). I never knew I was a bilingual: reimaging teacher identities in TESOL. *Journal of Language, Identity & Education*, *2*, 251-268.

Reis, D. S. (2010). Non-native English-speaking teachers and professional Legitimacy: A sociocultural theoretical perspective on identity realization (Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation). The Pennsylvania State University.

Reves, T., & Medgyes, P. (1994). The non-native English speaking EFL/ESL teacher's self image: An international survey. *System*, *22*, 353-367.

Sewell, W. (1992). A theory of structure: Duality, agency and transformation. *American Journal of Sociology*, *98*, 1-29.

Varghese, M., Morgan, B., Johnston, B., & Johnson, K. (2005). Theorizing language teacher identity: Three perspectives and beyond. *Journal of Language, Identity, and Education*, *4*, 21-44.

Varghese, M. M. (2007). Language teacher research methods. In K. King (Ed.), *The encyclopedia of language and education* (pp. 287-298). Heidelberg, Germany: Springer.

Wacquant, L. (1989). Toward a reflective sociology: A workshop with Pierre Bourdieu. *Sociological Theory*, *7*, 26-63.

Wolcott, H. F. (2005). The art of (conceptual) self-defense. In H. F. Wolcott (Ed.), *The art of fieldwork* (pp. 151-168). Lanham, MD: Altamira Press.

Wu, A., Liang, J., & Csepelyi, T. (2010). Coping strategies for NNES teachers' development. In A. Mahboob (Ed.), *The NNEST lens: Non native English speakers in TESOL* (pp. 202-221). Newcastle upon Tyne, England: Cambridge Scholars.

Wu, M. H. (2011). Language planning and policy in Taiwan Past, present, and future.

Language Problems & Language Planning, *35*, 15-34.

Yin, R. K. (2003). *Case study research: Design and methods*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Yin, R. K. (2006). Case study methods. In J. L. Green, G. Camilli, & P. B. Elmore (Eds.), *Handbook of complementary methods in education research* (pp. 111-122). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.

Pei Chia Liao

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The author would like to thank the anonymous reviewers of the *Taiwan Journal of TESOL* for their constructive comments which helped the author to examine the presented themes more critically and thoroughly. The author also would like to express her sincere gratitude to the teachers who joined the research study.

CORRESPONDENCE

Pei Chia Liao, Foreign Language Center, Feng Chia University, Taichung, Taiwan
Email address:peichial@gmail.com

語言資產，自我動能，以及關於他們身為合理化英語教師之觀點

廖珮珈
逢甲大學

英語非母語之英語教師本身的教育背景多元: 例如，有些是從英語系國家獲得學位後，回到自身非英語系國家從事教學工作，有些則是在本地非英語系國家取得學位後，在當地從事英語教學工作。然而英語教學的學術領域裡，研究議題特別強調「在非英語系國家受教育之英語教師」的並不多，關於這些教師如何利用資源並看待本身身為合理化之英語教師的研究更是鮮少。本研究探討兩位在台灣獲得學位之大學英語教師，利用哪些資源培植為自我優勢，進而建構本身從事英語教學的合理性。文中以 Bourdieu (1977a, 1977b, 1986) 闡述的資本概念，加上諸位學者對於自我動能的觀點來架構本研究的論述。此研究發現，這些英語教師認為他們的英語語言資產是他們成為合理化之英文教師的首要必備條件。此外，本研究分析在台灣社經與教學環境下，老師們的語言資產，以及他們如何應用此資產發展為教學優勢，幫助他們認定身為英語教師之合理性。此研究也指出自我動能與資產的相關性。另外，經由研究結果分析，儘管老師們身為優秀的英語使用者，他們皆認為自己不享有英語擁有權。本研究也提出對於英文非母語之英語教師師資培育，以及其教師專業發展之建議。

關鍵詞：語言資產、自我動能、英語擁有權